

1 ROB BONTA  
2 Attorney General of California  
3 MARK R. BECKINGTON  
4 Supervising Deputy Attorney General  
5 ROBERT L. MEYERHOFF  
6 Deputy Attorneys General  
7 State Bar No. 298196  
8 300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702  
9 Los Angeles, CA 90013-1230  
10 Telephone: (213) 269-6177  
11 Fax: (916) 731-2144  
12 E-mail: Robert.Meyerhoff@doj.ca.gov  
13 *Attorneys for Rob Bonta, in his Official Capacity as*  
14 *Attorney General of the State of California*

15 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
16 FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

17 **RENO MAY, et al.,**

18 Plaintiffs,

19 v.

20 **ROBERT BONTA, in his official**  
21 **capacity as Attorney General of the**  
22 **State of California,**

23 Defendant.

Case Nos. 8:23-cv-01696 CJC (ADSx)

**DEFENDANT'S ANSWER TO  
FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT  
FOR DECLARATORY AND  
INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

Courtroom: 10B  
Judge: Hon. Mónica Ramírez Almadani  
Action Filed: September 26, 2023

Defendant Rob Bonta, in his official capacity as Attorney General of the State of California, submits his answer in response to Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief (the FAC) (Dkt. No. 65). Defendant hereby answers the FAC, in paragraphs that correspond to the FAC's paragraphs, as follows:<sup>1</sup>

## INTRODUCTION<sup>2</sup>

1. Paragraph No. 1. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

2. Paragraph No. 2. Defendant admits that California law requires applicants for a license to carry a concealed handgun or to carry a loaded and exposed handgun are required to meet certain requirements, including, among other things, completing an application, undergoing a background check, completing firearms training, and paying certain fees. The remaining allegations in this paragraph consist of legal arguments and contentions that require no response, but to the extent a response is required, Defendant denies each and every such allegation.

3. Paragraph No. 3. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

4. Paragraph No. 4. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

5. Paragraph No. 5. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

---

<sup>1</sup> The following responses to each paragraph include responses to any footnotes that may be contained in the relevant paragraph.

<sup>2</sup> For the convenience of the Court and the parties, Defendant utilizes certain headings as set forth in the FAC. In doing so, Defendant neither admits nor denies any allegations that may be suggested by the FAC's headings.

6. Paragraph No. 6. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

## PARTIES

9. Paragraph No. 9. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

1           17. Paragraph No. 17. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
2 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

3           18. Paragraph No. 18. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
4 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

5           19. Paragraph No. 19. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
6 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

7           20. Paragraph No. 20. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
8 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

9           21. Paragraph No. 21. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
10 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

11           22. Paragraph No. 22. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
12 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

13           23. Paragraph No. 23. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
14 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

15           24. Paragraph No. 24. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
16 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

17           25. Paragraph No. 25. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
18 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

19           26. Paragraph No. 26. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
20 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

21           27. Paragraph No. 27. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
22 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

23           28. Paragraph No. 28. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
24 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

25           29. Paragraph No. 29. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
26 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

27           30. Paragraph No. 30. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
28 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

1           31. Paragraph No. 31. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
2 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

3           **Defendants**

4           32. Paragraph No. 32. Defendant admits that Rob Bonta is the Attorney General of the  
5 State of California, that he is the chief law officer of California, and that he has various duties  
6 under California law. The remaining allegations in this paragraph consist of legal arguments and  
7 contentions that require no response, but to the extent a response is required, Defendant denies  
8 each and every such allegation.

9           33. Paragraph No. 33. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
10 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

11                                   **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

12           34. Paragraph No. 34. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
13 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
14 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

15           35. Paragraph No. 35. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
16 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
17 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

18           36. Paragraph No. 36. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
19 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
20 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

21           37. Paragraph No. 37. Defendant admits that the case entitled *Lance Boland, et al. v.*  
22 *Robert Bonta*, Case No. 8:22-cv-01421 is proceeding in the Central District of California, and that  
23 the Attorney General is a defendant in that case. The remaining allegations in this paragraph  
24 consist of legal arguments and contentions that require no response, but to the extent a response is  
25 required, Defendants deny each and every such allegation.

26           38. Paragraph No. 38. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain legal authority  
27 that speaks for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is  
28 required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

1           39. Paragraph No. 39. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
2 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
3 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

4           40. Paragraph No. 40. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
5 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
6 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

7           41. Paragraph No. 41. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
8 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
9 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

10           42. Paragraph No. 42. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
11 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
12 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

13           43. Paragraph No. 43. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
14 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
15 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

16           44. Paragraph No. 44. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
17 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
18 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

19           45. Paragraph No. 45. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
20 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
21 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

22           46. Paragraph No. 46. Defendant admits that on June 24, 2022, the Attorney General  
23 issued Legal Alert No. OAG-2022-02, “U.S. Supreme Court’s Decision in *New York State Rifle*  
24 *& Pistol Association v. Bruen*, No. 20-843.” The remaining allegations in this paragraph consist  
25 of legal arguments and contentions that require no response, but to the extent a response is  
26 required, Defendants deny each and every such allegation.

1       47. Paragraph No. 47. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
2 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
3 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

4       48. Paragraph No. 48. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
5 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
6 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

7       49. Paragraph No. 49. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
8 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
9 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

10       50. Paragraph No. 50. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
11 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

12       51. Paragraph No. 51. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
13 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

14       52. Paragraph No. 52. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
15 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

16       53. Paragraph No. 53. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
17 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

18       54. Paragraph No. 54. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
19 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

20       55. Paragraph No. 55. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
21 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

22       56. Paragraph No. 56. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
23 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

24       57. Paragraph No. 57. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
25 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

26       58. Paragraph No. 58. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument,  
27 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies  
28 each and every allegation.

1           59. Paragraph No. 59. Defendant admits that in California, concealed carry licenses are  
2 issued by county officials. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
3 remaining allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

4           60. Paragraph No. 60. Defendant admits that SB 918 was opposed by the California State  
5 Sheriffs' Association. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the remaining  
6 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

7           61. Paragraph No. 61. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
8 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

9           62. Paragraph No. 62. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
10 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

11           63. Paragraph No. 63. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
12 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

13           64. Paragraph No. 64. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument,  
14 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies  
15 each and every allegation.

16           65. Paragraph No. 65. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
17 legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendants. To the extent  
18 that a response is required, Defendants deny each and every allegation.

19                                   **LEGISLATIVE HISTORY OF SB 2**

20           66. Paragraph No. 66. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument,  
21 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies  
22 each and every allegation.

23           67. Paragraph No. 67. Defendant admits that there was an exposure of confidential  
24 personal data associated with the update of DOJ's 2022 Firearms Dashboard. The remaining  
25 allegations in this paragraph consist of legal arguments and contentions that require no response,  
26 but to the extent a response is required, Defendants deny each and every such allegation.

27           .



1           68. Paragraph No. 68. Defendant admits that SB 918 was introduced in the Legislature  
2 but did not pass in 2022. The remaining allegations in this paragraph consist of legal arguments  
3 and contentions that require no response, but to the extent a response is required, Defendants deny  
4 each and every such allegation.

5           69. Paragraph No. 69. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument,  
6 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies  
7 each and every allegation.

8           70. Paragraph No. 70. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument,  
9 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies  
10 each and every allegation.

11           71. Paragraph No. 71. Defendant admits that SB 2 was introduced in 2023, and that the  
12 language of new Penal Code Section 26230(a) is the same in SB 918 and SB 2. The remaining  
13 allegations in this paragraph consist of argument that requires no response, but to the extent a  
14 response is required, Defendant denies each and every such allegation.

15           72. Paragraph No. 72. Defendant admits that there was a press conference held on  
16 February 1, 2023, where new gun safety legislation was announced. This remaining allegations in  
17 this paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal  
18 authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendants. To the extent that a  
19 response is required, Defendants deny each and every allegation.

20           73. Paragraph No. 73. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
21 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

22           74. Paragraph No. 74. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
23 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

24           75. Paragraph No. 75. Defendant admits that the California State Sheriffs' Association  
25 also opposed SB 2 and SB 918. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
26 remaining allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

27           76. Paragraph No. 76. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
28 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.

1        77. Paragraph No. 77. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
2 legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent  
3 that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

4        78. Paragraph No. 78. Defendant admits that the legislative findings for SB 2 state that  
5 “when it comes to restrictions on carrying firearms in public, the United States Supreme Court  
6 has recognized three times that states may restrict the carrying of firearms in ‘sensitive places.’”  
7 This remaining allegations in this paragraph contain argument and legal contentions and legal  
8 authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a  
9 response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

10       79. Paragraph No. 79. Defendant admits that the legislative findings for SB 2 state that  
11 “[b]roadly allowing individuals to carry firearms in most public areas increases the number of  
12 people wounded and killed by gun violence.” This remaining allegations in this paragraph contain  
13 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no  
14 response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and  
15 every allegation.

16       80. Paragraph No. 80. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
17 legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent  
18 that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

19       81. Paragraph No. 81. Defendant admits that this paragraph’s quotation and citation to  
20 SB 2 is accurate.

21       82. Paragraph No. 82. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
22 legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent  
23 that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

24       83. Paragraph No. 83. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
25 legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent  
26 that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

1       84. Paragraph No. 84. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
2 legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent  
3 that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

4       85. Paragraph No. 85. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
5 legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent  
6 that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

7       86. Paragraph No. 86. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
8 legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent  
9 that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

10       87. Paragraph No. 87. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
11 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
12 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

13       88. Paragraph No. 88. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
14 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
15 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

16       89. Paragraph No. 89. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
17 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
18 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

19       90. Paragraph No. 90. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
20 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
21 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

22       91. Paragraph No. 91. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
23 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
24 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

25       92. Paragraph No. 92. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to respond to the  
26 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every allegation.  
27  
28

1           93. Paragraph No. 93. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
2 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
3 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

4           94. Paragraph No. 94. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
5 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
6 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

7                                   **DECLARATORY RELIEF ALLEGATIONS**

8           95. Paragraph No. 95. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
9 legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent  
10 that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

11           96. Paragraph No. 96. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
12 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
13 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

14           97. Paragraph No. 97. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
15 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
16 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

17           98. Paragraph No. 98. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
18 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
19 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

20                                   **INJUNCTIVE RELIEF ALLEGATIONS**

21           99. Paragraph No. 99. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
22 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
23 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

24           100. Paragraph No. 100. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and  
25 legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by  
26 Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

101. Paragraph No. 101. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

102. Paragraph No. 102. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

103. Paragraph No. 103. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

**FIRST CLAIM FOR DECLARATORY AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

104. Paragraph No. 104. Defendant incorporates by reference the answers in Paragraphs 1 through 103 above.

105. Paragraph No. 105. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

106. Paragraph No. 106. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

107. Paragraph No. 107. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

108. Paragraph No. 108. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

109. Paragraph No. 109. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

110. Paragraph No. 110. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

**PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

Defendant denies that Plaintiffs are entitled to the relief set forth in the Prayer for Relief immediately following paragraph 110, or to any relief whatsoever. To the extent that the Prayer for Relief states any allegations, Defendant denies them.

In addition, without admitting any allegations contained in the complaint, Defendant asserts the following defenses based on information and belief:

**FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

The Complaint, and the claims for relief alleged therein, fails to state facts sufficient to constitute a cause of action against Defendant.

**SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

Plaintiffs' claims in this action are barred in that Plaintiffs do not have standing to bring them.

**THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

The Complaint, and each cause of action therein, is improper as Plaintiffs have an adequate remedy at law.

**FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

The Complaint, and every cause of action therein, is barred by the equitable doctrines of estoppel, laches, unclean hands, and/or waiver.

**FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

To the extent that Defendant has undertaken any conduct with regard to the subjects and events underlying Plaintiffs' Complaint, such conduct was, at all times material thereto, undertaken in good faith and in reasonable reliance on existing law.

**SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

Defendant has not knowingly or intentionally waived any applicable affirmative defense. Defendant reserves the right to assert and rely upon other such defenses as may become available

1 or apparent during discovery proceedings or as may be raised or asserted by others in this case,  
2 and to amend the Answer and/or affirmative defenses accordingly. Defendant further reserves the  
3 right to amend the Answer to delete affirmative defenses that they determine are not applicable  
4 after subsequent discovery.

5 WHEREFORE, Defendant prays that:

- 6 1. Plaintiffs take nothing by reason of the Complaint;
- 7 2. Judgment be entered in favor of Defendant;
- 8 3. Defendant be awarded costs incurred in defending this action; and
- 9 4. Defendant be awarded such further relief that the Court may deem just and proper.

10 Dated: March 20, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

11 ROB BONTA  
12 Attorney General of California  
13 MARK R. BECKINGTON  
14 Supervising Deputy Attorney General

15 /s/ Robert L. Meyerhoff  
16 ROBERT L. MEYERHOFF  
17 Deputy Attorney General  
18 *Attorneys for Defendant Rob Bonta in his*  
19 *official capacity as Attorney General of the State*  
20 *of California*  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28